

Unit 17 - Classwork 4: Plato's *Gorgias* Dialogue (4)

~~*

In order to answer the following questions, read pages 22–24 in Unit 17.

1. In order to clarify why Socrates pitied unjust people, fill in the blanks. If you need to refresh your memory about what *modus ponens* and *modus tollens* syllogisms are, please feel free to use the space below the table.

L1	If he is unjust, then he is miserable.	<i>assumption</i>
L2	_____	<i>assumption</i>
L3	_____	<i>assumption</i>
L4	_____	In a <i>modus ponens</i> , if the premises are L1 and L2, then L4 is the logical conclusion.
L5	_____	In a <i>modus tollens</i> , if the premises are L1 and L3, then L5 is the logical conclusion.

modus ponens

(affirming the antecedent)

Premise 1: If **P** then **Q**.

Premise 2: **P**.

Conclusion: Therefore, **Q**.

modus tollens

(denying the consequent)

Premise 1: If **P** then **Q**.

Premise 2: *not-Q*.

Conclusion: Therefore, *not-P*.

valid

2. Polus and Socrates disagreed about how unpunished wrongdoing should be evaluated by a wrongdoer.
 - (i) According to Polus, why is it *good* for a wrongdoer if their wrongdoing goes unpunished?
 - (ii) According to Socrates, why is it *bad* for a wrongdoer if their wrongdoing goes unpunished?
 - (iii) From Book 2 of Plato's *Republic*, recall the Ring of Gyges. (See Unit 12.)
 - (a) By mentioning the Ring of Gyges, what was Glaucon's point?
 - (b) Based on what Socrates said about unpunished wrongdoing, how would the Ring of Gyges be bad for a wrongdoer?

3. Between *doing* wrong and *being* wronged, Socrates and Polus discussed which one of the two is *worse* (or *badder* or *more bad*). (Note: See pages 23–24 in Unit 17.)

(i) Let “ B_x ” stand for how *bad* it is for someone to *do* wrong, and let “ B_y ” stand for how *bad* it is for someone to *be* wronged. Moreover, assume that $B_x \geq 0$, and assume that $B_y \geq 0$. At first, why did Polus think that $B_y > B_x$?

(ii) Let “ P_x ” stand for how painful it is for someone to *do* wrong, and let “ P_y ” stand for how painful it is for someone to *be* wronged. Moreover, assume that $P_x \geq 0$, and assume that $P_y \geq 0$. Accordingly, why did Polus think that $P_y > P_x$?

(iii) Let “ D_x ” stand for how disgusting it is for someone to *do* wrong, and let “ D_y ” stand for how disgusting it is for someone to *be* wronged. Moreover, assume that $D_x \geq 0$, and assume that $D_y \geq 0$. Accordingly, why did Polus think that $D_x > D_y$?

(iv) According to Polus, $D_x = B_x + P_x$, and $D_y = B_y + P_y$. Why did he think so?

(v) According to Polus, if $D_x > D_y$, then $B_x + P_x > B_y + P_y$. Moreover, if $B_x + P_x > B_y + P_y$, then $B_x > B_y + P_y - P_x$. In the end, why did Polus think that $B_x > B_y$?

4. On the cure for misery (or unhappiness), consider what Socrates said.

(i) According to Socrates, what is the cure for misery?

(ii) According to Socrates, how does the cure for misery work?

5. On happy people and miserable (or unhappy) people, consider what Socrates said.

(i) According to Socrates, what kind of person is the happiest person?

(ii) According to Socrates, what kind of person is the unhappiest person?