

Unit 17 - Classwork 4: Plato's *Gorgias* Dialogue (4)

~~*

In order to answer the following questions, read pages 22–24 in Unit 17.

- In order to clarify why Socrates pitied unjust people, fill in the blanks. If you need to refresh your memory about what *modus ponens* and *modus tollens* syllogisms are, please feel free to use the space below the table.

L1	If he is unjust, then he is miserable.	<i>assumption</i>
L2	_____	<i>assumption</i>
L3	_____ –	<i>assumption</i>
L4	_____ –.	In a <i>modus ponens</i> , if the premises are L1 and L2, then L4 is the logical conclusion.
L5	_____ –	In a <i>modus tollens</i> , if the premises are L1 and L3, then L5 is the logical conclusion.

<i>modus ponens</i> (affirming the antecedent)	<i>modus tollens</i> (denying the consequent)	valid
Premise 1: If P then Q . Premise 2: P . Conclusion: Therefore, Q .	Premise 1: If P then Q . Premise 2: <i>not-Q</i> . Conclusion: Therefore, <i>not-P</i> .	

3. Between *doing* wrong and *being* wronged, Socrates and Polus discussed which one of the two is *worse* (or *badder* or *more bad*). (Note: See pages 23–24 in Unit 17.)
- (i) Let “ B_x ” stand for how *bad* it is for someone to *do* wrong, and let “ B_y ” stand for how *bad* it is for someone to *be* wronged. Moreover, assume that $B_x \geq 0$, and assume that $B_y \geq 0$. At first, why did Polus think that $B_y > B_x$?
- (ii) Let “ P_x ” stand for how painful it is for someone to *do* wrong, and let “ P_y ” stand for how painful it is for someone to *be* wronged. Moreover, assume that $P_x \geq 0$, and assume that $P_y \geq 0$. Accordingly, why did Polus think that $P_y > P_x$?
- (iii) Let “ D_x ” stand for how disgusting it is for someone to *do* wrong, and let “ D_y ” stand for how disgusting it is for someone to *be* wronged. Moreover, assume that $D_x \geq 0$, and assume that $D_y \geq 0$. Accordingly, why did Polus think that $D_x > D_y$?
- (iv) According to Polus, $D_x = B_x + P_x$, and $D_y = B_y + P_y$. Why did he think so?
- (v) According to Polus, if $D_x > D_y$, then $B_x + P_x > B_y + P_y$. Moreover, if $B_x + P_x > B_y + P_y$, then $B_x > B_y + P_y - P_x$. In the end, why did Polus think that $B_x > B_y$?

