

## Socratic Circle: Is it a lie?

1. One day, Jackie saw their classmate vandalizing the school restrooms. Even though Jackie did not tell on their classmate, the principal for some reason suspected that Jackie saw one of their classmates vandalizing the restrooms. Yet when the school principal asked Jackie about whether or not Jackie had seen someone vandalizing the school restrooms, Jackie answered, “No, I did *not* see someone vandalizing the school restrooms.”
  - (a) By giving that answer to the principal’s question, was Jackie telling a lie? *Why* or *why not*? Explain.

With whom did you *agree* (and why)?

With whom did you *disagree* (and why)?

- (b) Imagine that Jackie had *forgotten* about seeing their classmate vandalize the school restroom. In that case, was Jackie *still* telling a lie? *Why* or *why not*? Explain.

With whom did you *agree* (and why)?

With whom did you *disagree* (and why)?

2. Chris, Sam, and Pat were classmates. Chris and Sam were friends, but Chris and Pat really disliked each other. One day, Chris saw Sam and Pat vandalizing the restrooms *together*. When the school principal asked Chris about who vandalized the school restrooms, Chris answered, "Pat vandalized the school restrooms!"

- (a) By giving that answer to the principal's question, was Chris telling a lie? *Why* or *why not*? Explain.

With whom did you *agree* (and why)?

With whom did you *disagree* (and why)?

- (b) Imagine that Chris had forgotten about seeing Sam vandalize the school restroom. In that case, was Chris still telling a lie? *Why* or *why not*? Explain.

With whom did you *agree* (and why)?

With whom did you *disagree* (and why)?

3. Chris and Jackie are identical twins. In fact, they are so identical that sometimes even their parents have trouble telling them apart! Yet as cute as that might be, there was trouble. The twins were classmates of Sam. One day, Sam saw their classmate vandalizing the school restrooms. Yet even though Sam was convinced that Jackie was the vandal, the *actual* vandal was Jackie's identical twin Chris. Nonetheless, Sam was convinced that the vandal was Jackie (rather than Sam). Hence upon being asked by the school principle about who vandalized the school restrooms, Sam said, "Jackie vandalized the restrooms!" By giving that answer to the principal's question, was Sam telling a lie? *Why* or why *not*? Explain.

With whom did you *agree* (and why)?

With whom did you *disagree* (and why)?

4. Pat and Jackie were classmates, and they hated each other. One day, Pat vandalized the school restrooms, but nobody witnessed the vandalization. Yet even so, Jackie told on Pat to the principle.

(a) When telling on Pat to the principle, imagine Jackie said, "I saw Pat vandalizing the school restrooms!" Would Jacking have been telling a lie? *Why* or why *not*? Explain.

With whom did you *agree* (and why)?

With whom did you *disagree* (and why)?

(b) When telling on Pat to the principle, imagine Jackie said, "Pat vandalized the school restrooms!" Would Jacking have been telling a lie? *Why* or why *not*? Explain.

With whom did you *agree* (and why)?

With whom did you *disagree* (and why)?

5. Chris, Sam, and Pat were classmates. Chris and Sam were friends, but Chris and Pat really disliked each other. One day, Chris saw Sam vandalizing the restrooms. Right before *Sam* vandalized the school restrooms, *Pat* was vandalizing the restrooms. Yet since *Sam* was the only student who Chris saw vandalizing the restrooms, Chris *mistakenly* thought that Sam was the *only* student who did so. Expecting to be questioned by the principal, Chris decided to frame Pat rather than snitch on Sam. Besides being Sam's homie, Chris really disliked Pat. Hence when the principal asked Chris *who* vandalized the school restrooms, Chris answered, "Pat vandalized the restrooms!" By giving that answer to the principal's question, was Chris telling a lie? *Why* or *why not*? Explain.

With whom did you *agree* (and why)?

With whom did you *disagree* (and why)?

6. What are some things that you *wished* you'd said (but, for *whatever* reason, *didn't* say)?

- Scenario 1 -

- Scenario 2 -

- Scenario 3 -

- Scenario 4 -

- Scenario 5 -